My main argument is, that as things are today [sic] it is absolutely impossible in this country for a woman composer to get ahead and to keep her head above water...Note for instance how differently the Press reacts in the case of men and of women. Once I had grasped that it would take all one's courage to keep going at all, I gave up reading Press notices.

Ethel Smyth, Female Pipings in Eden<sup>1</sup>

Ethel Smyth frequently and publicly deplored the sex bias that kept her from achieving musical success in her lifetime. She blamed the Press in particular for failing to recognise the quality of her music and considering only male composers' music worthwhile. Examining the critical reception of her music makes it possible to evaluate Smyth's complaint of unfair treatment. This article traces the importance of gender, and what was said about it, through reviews of her Mass, based on performances in 1893 and 1924, and of the English premieres of her three central operas: Der Wald [The Forest], The Wreckers and The Boatswain's Mate.<sup>2</sup> A chronological survey of these performances reveals that while gender was highly significant in reviews of the Mass, its importance decreased, as the years passed, in favour of other contemporary musical issues.<sup>3</sup> Despite this development, later secondary sources returned to the earlier focus on Smyth as 'woman composer', dwelling on her eccentricities and distorting the relative importance of various biographical and professional issues. This article presents the range of reflections on Smyth's gender and also outlines the issues which dominated the criticism when the focus moved away from the 'woman composer'.

An examination of references in encyclopedias and general histories reveals that Smyth's music was generally taken seriously during her lifetime, although she was also subject to adverse criticism. She was included in Brown and Stratton's *British Musical Biography* as early as 1897, when she was known in England chiefly for the Mass and two early orchestral works.<sup>4</sup> In spite of this early recognition, Smyth only slowly established herself as a composer in England; by the First World War she had become a well known figure on the musical scene. Quite apart from her feminist political activism as a suffragette, she was an outspoken advocate of a permanent, subsidised English opera and of the inclusion of women in orchestras. She communicated her beliefs with her pen, writing articles and innumerable letters, both personal and to the Press, the effect of which was strengthened by her powerful personal presence.

References often contain allusions to Smyth's literary output. During her lifetime, ten books of largely autobiographical content were published. They included feminist and musical polemic, and memoirs of such noteworthy figures as Emmeline Pankhurst, Thomas Beecham and Johannes Brahms. The success and popularity of her writings were often used as a means of undermining the value of her musical contributions, and formed part of the persona which was increasingly projected in the secondary literature. In 1954, J. A. Fuller-Maitland compared her skills in writing and composition in the following words: 'she continued to write books which showed again and again that, while as a composer who had a notable and, for a woman, quite exceptional talent, as a writer of English prose she possessed indisputable genius'.<sup>5</sup> Such appraisals by music critics seem intended to justify their unwillingness to recognise her significance as a composer.

Smyth's contributions were recognised publicly, if not critically, later in her life when she was awarded two honorary doctorates and was created a Dame of the British Empire. But it must be noted that she was denied the recognition that she craved most: continued performances of her compositions.

In later years, particularly after her death in 1944, attitudes towards Smyth changed. Many writers show little knowledge of her music and, more importantly, little interest in it. Brief biographies focus on her personality and her involvement with the suffragette movement, as illustrated by Percy Young's entry on Smyth in *A Critical Dictionary of Composers and their Music* (1954): 'Smyth...was a vivid personality, who achieved notoriety as a militant suffragette...but missed fame as a composer'.<sup>6</sup>

In a discussion of the Mass in the third edition of *Grove's Dictionary* (1928), H. C. Colles declared Smyth to be 'among the most eminent composers of her time, and easily at the head of all those of her own sex'.<sup>7</sup> Such a positive assessment of Smyth's work was rare beyond her lifetime, at least until recent years. The fifth edition of *Grove's Dictionary*, published only ten years after her death, contained the same article as the third

edition, slightly revised by Fuller-Maitland, who cut the description of *The Wreckers* considerably and deleted several superlatives. His most noteworthy revision however, was the omission of the phrase 'among the most eminent composers of her time' from the discussion of the Mass, which otherwise remained unchanged. This alteration is interesting as the sentence which contained it referred specifically to the Mass in D and its reception, and not to her later works. The article no longer reflected contemporary reception of the work, adapting itself instead to the verdict of history on Smyth's worth as a composer.

The Mass in D was first performed in 1893 and the fact that its performance by the Royal Choral Society was achieved largely as a result of Smyth's royal connections did not escape the notice of the critics. Through her friendship with the Empress Eugénie, Smyth was introduced to Queen Victoria and played sections of the Mass before the Court. This did not lead directly to a performance, but Smyth persevered, and was able to persuade the Queen's Private Secretary, Sir Henry Ponsonby, the husband of her close friend Lady Ponsonby, to speak to the Duke of Edinburgh, who was then President of the Royal Choral Society. Consequently, the Mass was included on a programme of the choir.<sup>8</sup> The social success of the performance was finally assured by several members of the royal family undertaking to be present; the royalty included the Empress who, in order to aid her young friend, broke her rule of never appearing in public.<sup>9</sup> The performance of the Mass was thus made possible by the support of a network of women. Throughout her life Smyth was nurtured by and contributed to an intimate circle of creative and influential women, and this female community was of inestimable importance to her. The writer of 'Musical Gossip' in The Musical Opinion noted that the 'champions of women's rights scored a great triumph...in the production...of Miss E. M. Smyth's Mass in D'.<sup>10</sup>

Although Smyth was not yet well known when the Mass was first performed and had taken the precaution of publishing the score under her initials only,<sup>11</sup> few critics missed the opportunity to muse on women's track record as composers, discuss what constituted the feminine in music, or even indulge in pseudo-psychological reflections on whether or not women really were capable of artistic creativity. The general feeling was that Smyth had set an unprecedented example for women by composing a 'grand musical work'<sup>12</sup> and that they knew of no better composition by a woman. The title of 'greatest woman composer' was to haunt her for the rest of her life.

A 'lady' writing a major work was so new and

strange that self-conscious gallantry is found in many reviews, or at least an apology for the ungallant behaviour of criticising a lady. Smyth was accused of excessive ambition in undertaking a work on a scale which would have suited the great masters, but which was considered sadly beyond her talents. The critic of *The Era* lamented the lack of beauty in Smyth's 'immense striving after grandiose effects' although he found 'a surprising amount of learning' in it.<sup>13</sup>

Several critics agreed that she would have done better if she had 'consulted only her own womanly promptings';<sup>14</sup> the characteristics of the 'eternal feminine' are invoked by statements such as 'female composers have always done best when trusting to feeling and emotion'.<sup>15</sup> The critic of *The Referee* found it quite proper that Smyth failed when her music became too masculine, and he was obviously disturbed by women's recent tendency to reappraise their roles, writing: 'Why will so many women of the present day not recognise that they are women, and that they are most attractive when they are most womanly?'<sup>16</sup> Indeed, T. L. Southgate of the *Musical News* wondered why Smyth should have chosen to write a Mass at all.<sup>17</sup>

This attitude led to a comparison of the individual movements on the basis of their suitability to a lady's creative impulses; this is exemplified by another quotation from *The Referee*:

In such unpretentious movements as her 'Sanctus' and 'Benedictus' she is charming, but her 'Gloria' and 'Credo' are unsatisfactory, because in these she attempts to handle large forms for which she has not the strength.<sup>18</sup>

This refers perhaps to Smyth's extensive contrapuntal writing in sections of the Credo, and the bold opening and dynamic use of the full ensemble in the Gloria. But the problem is not just one of technique. Smyth is criticised for allowing intellect to dominate, leaving insufficient scope for emotional expression:

> [T]he general character of the music not only points to more calculation than inspiration, but indicates a resolve to prove that a woman can write masculine music as well as a man.<sup>19</sup>

Many critics preferred the Sanctus and especially the Benedictus to the other movements. The latter is scored for soprano solo accompanied by women's voices and *dolcissimo* orchestra. Expressive and simple in structure, it is clearly more 'feminine' in style. The critic of *The Daily Telegraph* concluded that 'Miss Smyth is able to attain both truth and beauty' in the Sanctus and Benedictus.<sup>20</sup> Such an assessment implies that there were sections that lacked full sincerity, and this issue relates to the religious nature of the work. George Bernard Shaw, reviewing the Mass for *The World*, detected an 'underlying profanity that makes the audience's work easy'.<sup>21</sup> He combined his reflection on the religiosity of the work with thoughts on the sex of its composer:

> If you take an average mundane young lady, and ask her what service to religion she most enjoys rendering, she will probably, if she is a reasonably truthful person, instance the decoration of a church at Christmas....Now I will not go so far as to say that Miss Smyth's musical decoration of the Mass is an exactly analogous case...but I must at least note that the decorative instinct is decidedly in front of the religious instinct all through, and that the religion is not of the widest and most satisfying sort.<sup>22</sup>

Shaw was not greatly disturbed by this, and commented that he would very much like to hear a comic opera from Miss Smyth's pen. He took the opportunity to express his conviction that women would be as successful in music as they had been in literature, if they only 'turned their attention to it'.<sup>23</sup>

Nine years after the Albert Hall performance of the Mass, Smyth finally achieved a Covent Garden production with her second opera Der Wald. By 1902, the critics were familiar with Smyth and were no longer quite so amazed by a woman composing large-scale works. The reviews bear witness to this, as they give various listings of her earlier works and their performances, while some mention her family or her German training, and others refer to the Berlin performance of Der Wald earlier that year. Smyth's growing reputation is attested to by The Morning Post critic's quotations and paraphrase of material about her in Tchaikovsky's travel diary of 1888, which was translated and included in Rosa Newmarch's biography, first published in 1902.<sup>24</sup> The passage about Smyth describes Tchaikovsky's first encounter with the young English composer; he commented on her musical promise and referred to her as a 'fellow-composer...one of the comparatively few women composers who may be seriously reckoned among the workers in this sphere of music'.25

Even though some critics alluded to Smyth's sex in reviews of *Der Wald*, it was no longer a central issue of contention and was most often only a passing reference. Where gender was discussed however, certain themes emerged. Two observations appeared repeatedly: that Smyth was the first woman to make such a significant contribution to music; and that she was better at it than any other woman before her. However these observations were sometimes used to qualify the assertion that Smyth was not a great composer. This is illustrated by phrases such as 'when has a woman so spoken to us in music before?'<sup>26</sup> and 'nor is Miss Smyth a great composer, though she is probably the leader of her sex'.<sup>27</sup>

Smyth was not only compared with women composers; implicit comparison with men can be read into reviews which make allowance for her on the basis of her sex. The critic of The Evening Standard felt that Smyth 'showed considerable command of resource and an adeptness in writing for the orchestra unusual in a woman'.<sup>28</sup> The Daily Telegraph's columnist however, engaged more critically with the issue of gender. He admitted that the critic will not easily forget that he is discussing a composition by a woman, but for himself 'can frankly say that no sex allowance is...made. Nor, in truth, is it called for'. Despite this carefully articulated stance, the critic did not hesitate to proclaim earlier in the same review that Smyth must be credited with 'speaking the strongest and most impressive word in music that her sex has ever uttered'.<sup>29</sup>

Whereas the Mass had aroused the criticism that Smyth had been over-ambitious in her use of largescale structures and contrapuntal techniques, the responses to *Der Wald* raised issues of stylistic affiliation and national operatic idiom. Her 'ambition' was now manifested in her composition of a music-drama, the apex of modern musical expression, and as a woman she was thought to lack the creative strength it required.

There was extensive discussion of the German influence on this work, of the importance of Wagner and Brahms in particular. The concerted vocal music of the prologue and epilogue was compared to Brahms's choral writing,<sup>30</sup> but the critic of *The Musical News* heard in it 'something of the femininity which we have a right to look for in a woman's compositions'. The rest of the opera he thought Wagnerian, a fact which he 'cannot help deploring...Humperdinck did something with it, but it is unsuited to a woman. Wagner is more often an obsession than an inspiration, and has proved so in this case'.<sup>31</sup> In ascribing feminine characteristics to passages considered Brahmsian, and 'masculinity' to the Wagnerian style, the critic reveals more about himself than about *Der Wald*.

This debate about stylistic influence must be seen in the context of the concern with the establishment of a national school of English opera. The general tone of the reviews of *Der Wald* is positive, as many critics were supportive of a composer whose work was one of the few signs of hope on the English scene. *Der Wald* was performed in a double bill with Hubert Bunning's new opera *La Princesse Osra* and the inevitable comparisons ensued. The critics tried to encourage Bunning, but generally found his work musically and dramatically ineffective, overwhelmed by what one termed a 'sugary syrup of Massenet'.<sup>32</sup> There was some dismay that two supposedly English novelties were, on the one hand so French, and on the other hand so German. But many found an encouraging sign for English opera in the success of *Der Wald*, and expressed the hope that it might 'lead other young British composers to turn their attention to things dramatic'.<sup>33</sup> The critic of *The Musical Opinion* reflected:

> It has been rather curious to read the patronising remarks of some of the critics on the score of Miss Smyth's sex. They have implied that the work is wonderful for a woman. I would rather say that it is the one English opera of any importance either by man or woman which has been produced at Covent Garden.<sup>34</sup>

This signals a change of focus in the criticism of Smyth's operas, for the issue of English opera is the major preoccupation in the reviews of The Wreckers and The Boatswain's Mate, while interest in Smyth's sex becomes secondary. The Wreckers was more English than the Germanic Der Wald, both in language and subject matter, and many of the critics greeted it as leading the way for British opera. Filson Young of The Saturday Review could not forget that the composer was a woman, but he placed this in context by writing: 'I was preoccupied before the beginning of the performance...with the thought of how remarkable it was that we were about to hear a really English modern opera; how remarkable that it should be really produced; how remarkable that it should have been written by a woman'.<sup>35</sup> E. A. Baughan of *The Daily News* wrote a very thorough and critical review, which was notably free of gender bias, the only comment on 'Miss Smyth's' sex being well excused by what followed it: 'To say it is good for a woman is an insult, for it is musically the best music-drama written by any British composer of modern days'.<sup>36</sup>

But the reviews of the two seasons of *The Wreckers* still contained passing references to Smyth's sex, especially declarations of her pre-eminence among women composers. It is curious that *The Wreckers*, and not the two earlier works, inspired the only reviews in this study which mention Smyth's sex in their titles, with headings such as 'A Woman's Opera'.<sup>37</sup> or the more nationalist 'Englishwoman's Opera'.<sup>38</sup> The critic of *The Standard* was sufficiently impressed to declare that by Smyth's 'operatic efforts, she is one of the few women who have seriously threatened to dispute man's supremacy in the world of creative music'.<sup>39</sup> But this

positive, if slightly paranoid, view was by no means universal.

Filson Young recovered from his pre-performance musings to conclude that 'part of the aridity and unkindness and sometimes excessive masculinity of the music is due to the fact that Miss Smyth is a woman and not a man'. He then searched his memory for any 'work of art by a woman in which femininity is given a real expression'; according to Young, men had a monopoly on the expression of tenderness and feminine emotion in art.<sup>40</sup> The ability to transcend their masculinity is what was generally seen in the nineteenth century to confer artistic genius on the fortunate male sex. Alfred Kalisch of *The Manchester Guardian* concurred, finding it curious that *The Wreckers* lacked just those qualities which he had expected to find in a woman's music: 'restraint, subtlety, and charm'.<sup>41</sup>

Ethel Smyth was not known for her subtlety. Already in 1909, a critic had alluded to her tendency to harangue the press if she disagreed with their attitudes; he suggested 'judicious cuts' but added that 'probably Miss Smyth will not agree with us'.<sup>42</sup> By 1916, when The Boatswain's Mate was first performed, Smyth's outspoken behaviour was even more notorious as a result of her two-year involvement with the suffragettes. A. J. Sheldon, writing for the Musical Opinion, noted that Smyth had 'accused the local critics of lacking a sense of humour in their treatment of her work and being one of the critics presumably included in that rating--one must tread warily to avoid a second castigation'.<sup>43</sup> Robin Legge of *The Daily Telegraph* also responded to a letter in which Smyth had accused him of 'erroneous statements' in an earlier article. After quoting from her letter, he assured his readers that 'the apparently opprobrious epithet "woman composer" did not occur in *The Daily Telegraph'*.<sup>44</sup>

The critics were not only aware of Smyth's active pen in defence of her rights, but had also, during the previous twenty years, become acquainted with her personality, both musical and public. They had all witnessed her public activism, including her celebrated two-month jail sentence for smashing the window of a cabinet minister. After a 1923 performance of *The Boatswain's Mate*, Dyneley Hussey affirmed the originality of Smyth's voice and characterised it thus: 'there is a square cut, a kind of sharp-elbowedness, about her tunes, which is quite personal—dare one say, a trifle old-maidish?'<sup>45</sup> Obviously, he did dare.

The appearance of two new English operas in 1916, The Boatswain's Mate and Charles Villiers Stanford's The Critic, led many reviewers to reflect that perhaps comic opera was the natural style for English opera. The Boatswain's Mate was more 'English' than any of Smyth's earlier operas; both the story and the sense of humour were distinctly native, as was the ballad opera style of the first act. The opera was both celebrated and criticised at its premiere for the use of English folk tunes, which were seen to be a vital component in the creation of a national style at the time. Many reviews listed the specific tunes used, and Robin Legge acknowledged the interest in the musical community from 'a well-armed body of musicians who look for our national musical salvation to the use that is to be made of the folk-song'.<sup>46</sup>

Unlike many of her contemporaries both in England and abroad, Smyth did not integrate the folk idiom in her own music. Legge quoted her as saying that she used 'a few English melodies' not in support of any theory, but simply because they suited her quintessentially English subject matter.<sup>47</sup> Her adaptation of folk tunes to her own style did not meet with universal critical approval. Edwin Evans acted as a spokesman for more progressive nationalist tendencies when he wrote: 'Instead of taking these tunes and using them elaborately, it would have been wiser to fashion others in the same idiom, and use them simply'.<sup>48</sup> *The Boatswain's Mate* did not fit in with either certain notions of English nationalism or international trends of folk song use.

Smyth had not chosen The Boatswain's Mate for its English subject alone. It did not escape critical notice that she had employed a plot with a feisty and independent heroine who was more than equal to the two men pitted against her. Several critics observed that Smyth's heroine was a woman after her own heart, and that the story slyly hinted at woman's superiority to man,<sup>49</sup> and this element was not always well received. The critic of The Times struggled to reconcile Smyth's feminism with her 'strangely unsympathetic' writing for the female voice.<sup>50</sup> It irritated Evans that the plot was 'made to serve the purposes of feministic propaganda',<sup>51</sup> and many felt that the opera and its comedy succeeded in spite of this aspect of the plot, rather than because of it. Few could ignore Smyth's incorporation into the opera's overture of The March of the Women, the anthem which she wrote for the suffragette movement, although some found this less than subtle.

Smyth's personal politics rarely feature in reviews of the revival of her Mass in 1924, which came just over a year after she was created a Dame of the British Empire. She had waited over 30 years to hear the Mass performed a second time, and many of the critics deplored the injustice of this long neglect. A couple refer to her claims of gender bias being the cause, but Eric Blom concludes in the *Manchester Guardian* that to emphasise Smyth's gender and call her 'pre-eminent among creative women musicians is to give a giant credit for having won a race against pygmies'.<sup>52</sup> This is valuable praise for Smyth, but hardly flattering for women in general.

Several critics suggest reasons other than gender for the Mass' long neglect, the most common cause being that a plethora of 'good' choral works had been composed in the 1890s, many of which had received one performance only and then dropped into obscurity. Sidney Grew suggested that if Smyth had continued to write large choral works, she might have had more chance of their being remembered. He also identified the performance of the Mass as part of a growing revival of pre-Elgarian choral and orchestral music which was sparking a positive reappraisal of the music of such composers as Stanford and Parry.<sup>53</sup> The critic of The Morning Post compared Smyth with her peers, concluding that she showed evidence of 'independent thinking' in the Mass, which was musically much better than its competitors because it was 'guiltless of the formalism and sentimentality committed by most other British works of the time'.54

Compared with the criticisms of 1893, those of 1924 give a considered and careful response to the music of the Mass. The musical evaluations are relatively detailed and a combination of positive and negative assessments of the work's worth can be found. Yet it was perhaps easy to praise a work of the past whose composer had achieved national status as a 'character', and which was unlikely to play any further role in English musical life. Critics at the premieres of Smyth's major compositions seem to have been disturbed by her bold style, both personal and musical. Yet while it would be foolish to deny that Smyth's sex militated against her gaining performances of her music, this issue is fundamental only to the very early reviews. Most of the critics were much more concerned with the problems of English opera, than with the fact that one of the contributors to the genre was a woman.

Shaw provides a unique and idiosyncratic summation of the issue in a letter to Smyth dated 9 March 1924, in which he responded to the second performance of the Mass. He declared it to be a magnificent work and continued: 'You are totally and diametrically wrong in imagining that you have suffered from a prejudice against feminine music. On the contrary you have been almost extinguished by the dread of masculine music.'<sup>55</sup>

## Notes

 Female Pipings in Eden, 2nd ed. (n.p.: Peter Davies, 1934), pp.4, 28.
Mass in D composed 1801 and in 160 female 1801.

<sup>2</sup> Mass in D composed 1891, premiered 18 January 1893, Royal Albert Hall, subsequently performed February 1924, Birmingham and March 1924, London; *Der Wald* composed 1899-1901, first performed in England 18 July 1902, Covent Garden; *The Wreckers* composed 1902-04, first performed in England 22 June 1909, His Majesty's Theatre, London, subsequently performed March 1910, Covent Garden; *The Boatswain's Mate* composed 1913-14, premiered 28 January 1916, Shaftesbury Theatre, London. Jory Bennett, comp., 'List of Works', *The Memoirs of Ethel Smyth*, ed. Ronald Crichton (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Viking-Penguin, 1987), pp.376– 77, 379.

<sup>3</sup> It must be noted that the disappearance of overtly sexist comments from the reviews does not necessarily indicate that the works received 'equal' treatment, free of bias against women.

 <sup>4</sup> Serenade in D premiered 26 April 1890, Crystal Palace; Overture to Shakespeare's Antony and Cleopatra premiered 18
October 1890, Crystal Palace; Bennett, 'List of works', p.376.
<sup>5</sup> J. A. Fuller-Maitland rev., H. C. Colles, 'Smyth, (Dame) Ethel (Mary)', Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Eric Blom, 5th ed. (London: Macmillan, 1954).

<sup>6</sup> Percy M. Young, A Critical Dictionary of Composers and their Music (London: Dennis Dobson, 1954), p.312.

<sup>7</sup> H. C. Colles, 'Smyth, Dame Ethel Mary', *Grove's Dictionary* of *Music and Musicians*, ed. H. C. Colles, 3rd ed. (London: Macmillan, 1928).

<sup>8</sup> Ethel Smyth, 'Two Glimpses of Queen Victoria', *Streaks of Life* (London: Longmans, Green and co., 1921), p.109.

<sup>9</sup> Ethel Smyth, 'The Empress Eugénie', *Streaks of Life*, p.13. The Empress had funded the printing of some of Smyth's earliest works, but it is unclear whether she funded the publication of the Mass, or whether Novello took it up independently.

<sup>10</sup> Musical Opinion and Music Trade Review (hereafter Musical Opinion), February 1893, p.274. Most reviews referred to in this article were unsigned, although the writers for the Musical Opinion often use pseudonyms which I have been unable to trace. The critics were mainly men, and will thus be referred to as 'he'. Where a critic's name is known it is mentioned in the text.

<sup>11</sup> The advertisement for the Novello (vocal) score listed her as 'E. M. Smyth'; *Musical Times*, February 1893, p.112. This was noted by the columnist of the *Musical Opinion*, who commented that 'Miss Smyth...[who] desires no favour for her sex, uses only the initials of her *prénoms* on her musical compositions'; *Musical Opinion*, February 1893, p.271.

<sup>12</sup> Lady, 26 January 1893, p.101.

- <sup>13</sup> Era, 21 January 1893, p.15.
- <sup>14</sup> Daily Telegraph, 19 January 1893, p.3.
- <sup>15</sup> Era, 21 January 1893, p.15.

<sup>16</sup> *Referee*, 22 January 1893, p.2.

- <sup>17</sup> Musical News, 21 January, p.55.
- <sup>18</sup> Referee, 22 January 1893, p.2.
- <sup>19</sup> Daily Telegraph, 19 January 1893, p.3.
- <sup>20</sup> Daily Telegraph, 19 January 1893, p.3.

<sup>21</sup> 'Miss Smyth's Decorative Instinct', World, 25 January 1893; rpt. in *Shaw's Music: the complete musical criticism in three volumes*, ed. Dan H. Laurence, vol. 2 (London: Max Reinhardt, The Bodley Head, 1981), p.791.

<sup>22</sup> Shaw, 'Miss Smyth's Decorative Instinct', p.791.

<sup>23</sup> Shaw, 'Miss Smyth's Decorative Instinct', p.793.

<sup>24</sup> Rosa Newmarch, *Tchaikovsky: his life and works with extracts from his writings, and the diary of his tour abroad in 1888* (London: Reeves, 1908).

<sup>25</sup> Newmarch, *Tchaikovsky*, p.194. The review which quotes this same phrase, among others, is found in the *Morning Post*, 19 July 1902, p.5.

<sup>26</sup> Daily Telegraph, 19 July 1902, p.9.

<sup>27</sup> Times, 19 July 1902, p.8.

<sup>28</sup> Evening Standard, 19 July 1902, p.2.

<sup>29</sup> Daily Telegraph, 19 July 1902, p.9.

<sup>30</sup> For example 'How faithful a disciple of Brahms and his school she appears in the very first pages of the score'; Daily *Telegraph*, 19 July 1902, p.9.

<sup>31</sup> *Musical News*, 26 July 1902, p.72.

<sup>32</sup> Musical Opinion, August 1902, p.818.

<sup>33</sup> Times, 29 July 1902, p.11.

34 Musical Opinion, August 1902, pp.818-19.

- <sup>35</sup> Saturday Review, 26 June 1909, p.810.
- <sup>36</sup> Daily News, 23 June 1909, p.3.

<sup>37</sup> Manchester Guardian, 23 June 1909, p.7.

38 Daily Mail, 23 June 1909, p.3. It is interesting to note that in the Daily Mail's review of the 1910 performance of *The Wreckers* a heading of this kind was again used: 'Woman's Opera'; Covent Garden scrapbook of Beecham Season March 1910.

<sup>39</sup> Standard; Covent Garden scrapbook of Beecham Season March 1910.

- <sup>40</sup> Saturday Review, 26 June 1909, p.811.
- <sup>41</sup> Manchester Guardian, 23 June 1909, p.7.
- <sup>42</sup> Athenacum, 26 June 1909, p.766.
- <sup>43</sup> Musical Opinion, July 1916, p.649.
- 44 Daily Telegraph, 22 January 1916, p.4.
- 45 Saturday Review, 16 June 1923, p.800.
- <sup>46</sup> Daily Telegraph, 22 January 1916, p.5.
- <sup>47</sup> Daily Telegraph, 22 January 1916, p.5.
- 48 English Review, 22 (Jan-June 1916), p.233.
- <sup>49</sup> Musical Times, March 1916, p.155.
- <sup>50</sup> Times, 20 March 1919, p.12.
- <sup>51</sup> English Review, 22 (Jan–June 1916) p.233.
- 52 Manchester Guardian, 10 March 1924.
- <sup>53</sup> Musical Times, February 1924, p.140.
- 54 Morning Post, 10 March 1924.
- <sup>55</sup> Quoted in Christopher St. John, *Ethel Smyth: a biography* (London: Longmans, Green & co., 1959) p.185.