

Sicut malum: Hildegard of Bingen and the Setting of Song of Songs 2:3-6 in Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek 107¹

Catherine Jeffreys

Among the manuscripts once in possession of the abbey of St Eucharius in Trier are copies of each of Hildegard of Bingen's principal theological works: the *Scivias* (1141–1151), the *Liber vitae meritorum* (1158–1163) and the *Liber divinorum operum* (c.1163–c.1174).² These three works represent the greater part of Hildegard's *opera omnia*, and their location at St Eucharius is but one outcome of the close ties cultivated between this abbey and Rupertsberg (Hildegard's home from c.1150 to 1179) during her life time.

There are also several minor sources of her works from St Eucharius. On the final three half-folios (76^r–77^v) of one of these, Trier Priesterseminar Bibliothek Hs. 107 (1124/–), there is a copy of her commentary on Song of Songs 2:3 from *Scivias* III, 8:16 and an unneumed verse and repetenda from her Marian responsory *Ave Maria*.³ These two texts are followed on the final half-folio by *Sicut malum*, an anonymous setting written in staff notation of the Song of Songs 2:3-6.⁴ Settings of verses from these four are found in the Gregorian repertory, primarily in conjunction with feasts celebrating virginity,⁵ but as there is no rubrication in Trier 107, this version of *Sicut malum* appears simply to complement the commentary. The purpose of the present study is to explore the possibility that Hildegard composed this setting of *Sicut malum*.

The similarity between the melodic style of this setting and Hildegard's distinctive melodic style is striking. One is prevented, however, from taking her authorship for granted as *Sicut malum* is not among the seventy-seven settings included in surviving sources of her music, in particular the two cyclic sources, Dendermonde, St Peter's & Paul's Abbey Codex 9 (c.1175) and

¹ This article was originally prepared for the Bibliothek des Bischöflichen Priesterseminars, Trier. I owe a particular debt of gratitude to the Director, Dr Michael Embach, who prepared a German translation of this paper. See Catherine Jeffreys, *Sicut malum: Hildegard von Bingens Vertonung von Hohelied 2, 3–6*, trans. M. Embach, Mitteilung und Verzeichnisse aus der Bibliothek des Bischöflichen Priesterseminars zu Trier 11 (Trier: Paulinus Verlag, 1998).

² The *Scivias*: Bernkastel-Kues Cusanusstift Hs. 63, prepared at St Eucharius in 1210; the *Liber vitae meritorum*: Trier Bibliothek des Priesterseminars Hs. 68, prepared during the 1170s at Rupertsberg; and the *Liber divinorum operum*: Ghent, University Library MS 241, prepared at Rupertsberg c.1175. I would like to thank Constant Mews (Department of History, Monash University) for drawing my attention to these manuscripts. See Petrus Becker, *Das Erzbistum Trier 8: Die Benediktinerabtei St Eucharius-St Matthias vor Trier*, *Germania Sacra* n.s. 34 (Berlin & New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1996) 115–27.

³ Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 115.

⁴ The potential interest of this setting to musicologists has been previously mentioned by Hildegard scholar Sr Angela Carlevaris. See Hildegard von Bingen, *Symphonia: Gedichte und Gesänge*, ed. & trans. Walter Berschin & Heinrich Schipperges (Gerlingen: Lambert Schneider, 1995) 247.

⁵ See for example, the settings of the first phrase of verse 3 and verses 5–6 in Worcester, Cathedral Chapter Library F.160; reproduced in *Antiphonaire Monastique XIII^e siècle: Codex F. 160 de La Bibliothèque de la Cathédrale de Worcester*, PM 12 (Berne: Herbert Lang, 1971) 353 & 360. The second half of verse 3 ('sub umbra illius quam desiderabam sedi et fructus eius dulcis gutturi meo') is included in the second Nocturne of Matins for the feast of the Visitation of the Virgin.

the Riesenkodex, Wiesbaden, Hessische Landesbibliothek Hs. 2,⁶ which include all seventy-seven songs between them.⁷ Another consideration might be that seventy-six of her known settings are on texts she composed herself. Yet her Kyrie and her settings of the Lesser Doxology indicate that she did set texts other than her own.⁸ In addition, other monastics in Germany during the twelfth century are known to have composed new musical settings to biblical texts.⁹

In order to establish Hildegard's authorship of *Sicut malum* it is necessary to demonstrate appropriate conditions for the transmission of this setting from Rupertsberg to St Eucharius. For this, the traditional concerns of medieval scholarship—circumstance, source and text—are met by an examination of the relationship between Hildegard and St Eucharius, discussion of the contents and historical locus of Trier 107, and comparison of melodic style between *Sicut malum* and examples from Hildegard's devotional song repertory.

Perhaps the strongest indicator that this setting is by Hildegard is precisely its preservation in a manuscript prepared at the St Eucharius abbey. This abbey, which was reconsecrated as St Matthias c.1142,¹⁰ was founded in the tenth century and, like Hildegard's first monastic home at Mt St Disibodenberg, was re-established early in the twelfth century after a period of decline.¹¹ According to Petrus Becker, the earliest reference to the St Eucharius scriptorium is found in the dedication to a copy of Augustine's *Retractationes* and Hieronymus' *Tractatus de oboedientia* prepared at St Eucharius in 1125;¹² it is stated here that copying was undertaken by the 'cantor' (and librarian?) Remigius under the direction of Eberhard, abbot of St Eucharius from 1111 to 1136. Becker also notes that the listing of a cantor as a senior copyist for the redaction of a literary codex suggests that the 'liturgical' library at St Eucharius was not separate from the 'reading' library.¹³ We can also assume from this that by the time members of St Eucharius began corresponding with Hildegard some twenty-five years later, the St Eucharius scriptorium

⁶ There are two other twelfth-century sources which preserve neumed settings by Hildegard: Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek 1016, which includes her Kyrie setting and her Alleluia verse (*O virga mediatrix*); and Stuttgart, Württembergische Landesbibliothek, theol. et phil. 4*253, which includes her responsory to Confessors *O vos imitatores*.

⁷ Convention has dictated the treatment of these two cycles as copies of a now-lost original completed c.1158. See Peter Dronke, 'The Composition of Hildegard of Bingen's *Symphonia*', *Sacris Erudiri* 19 (1969–70) 381–93; Albert Derolez & Peter Dronke, ed. & intro., *Hildegardis Bingensis, Liber divinorum operum, Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis* 92 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1996) viii; Ian Bent, 'Hildegard of Bingen', *New Grove Dictionary of Music & Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, vol. 8 (London: Macmillan, 1980) 554. There is evidence to suggest, however, that these two manuscripts represent independent compendiums of songs composed anywhere between the 1140s and the 1170s. See Catherine Jeffreys, 'Melodia et rhetorica: The Devotional Song Repertory of Hildegard of Bingen,' Diss. University of Melbourne, 1999, 1–32.

⁸ The Kyrie setting is included in the Riesenkodex but not in Dendermonde 9. One explanation for this might be that, unlike in Dendermonde 9, songs in the Riesenkodex are divided into two cycles (a cycle of versed songs and a cycle of stanzaic songs), with songs arranged according to subject matter, beginning with God the Father and descending through the celestial hierarchy. The Kyrie fulfils an important function as representative of God the Father and Son ('Lord have mercy, Christ have mercy') in the absence of songs devoted to either subject at the beginning of the second cycle. The Lesser Doxology is included for nine responsories in the Riesenkodex, and these responsories overlap with the five responsories with Lesser Doxologies in Dendermonde 9.

⁹ See Anselme de Havelberg, *Dialogues*, Book 1, ed. Gaston Salet (Paris: Du Cerf, 1966) 36. See also Jutta Seyfarth, *Speculum virginum, Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis* 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995) 376.

¹⁰ Manuscripts copied at the abbey after c.1142 continue to give St Eucharius (as well as St Matthias) as provenance. Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 83.

¹¹ Petrus Becker, 'Die Hirsauische Erneuerung des St Euchariusklosters in Trier,' *Consuetudines Monasticae*, ed. Joachim F. Angerer & Josef Lenzenweger (Rome: Ateneo S. Anselmo, 1982) 186.

¹² Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 115; Becker, 'Die Hirsauische Erneuerung' 205.

¹³ 'Die „liturgische“ Bibliothek scheint noch nicht von einer anderen, einer „Lese“bibliothek, getrennt zu sein.' Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 82.

was well established and there had been music scribes at the abbey from at least the 1120s.

During Hildegard's lifetime, a spiritual confraternity was promoted between Rupertsberg and St Eucharius, based on similarities between the spiritual and intellectual profiles of the two communities.¹⁴ According to Louise van Acker's dating of Hildegard's correspondence, the earliest known exchange between St Eucharius and Hildegard took place c.1148,¹⁵ or soon after the Synod of Trier (held between November 1147 and February 1148) where extracts from the *Scivias* were read and papal sanction was given to her work. During the following three decades, she corresponded with various members of the St Eucharius community including the abbots Bertulf (who reigned from 1136 to 1162), Gerwin (1162–68?) and Ludwig (1168–88)), the congregation of monks, and individual monks. It also appears that her work was read at St Eucharius as early as the 1150s, as suggested by a letter written c.1155 from the monks to Hildegard: 'we have been delighted in your letters, [and] certainly in the book the *Scivias*, just as in all rich offerings.'¹⁶

One legacy of this confraternity is the copies of Hildegard's three principle theological works housed at St Eucharius. Another is her devotional songs in honour of St Eucharius (the responsory *O euchari columba* and the sequence *O euchari in leta via*) and St Matthias (the sequence *Mathias sanctus*). For our purposes, however, the most significant legacy is the participation of members of the St Eucharius community in the preservation of her works. This participation appears to date from c.1173, the year of the death of Volmar of St Disibod, provost to the nuns at Rupertsberg and Hildegard's close friend and secretary since the 1140s. Before Volmar was replaced in 1174 by Godric of St Disibod (d.1175), several scholars came to Rupertsberg at Hildegard's request in order to assist her to complete the copying of the *Liber divinorum operum* (1170–74), which was incomplete upon Volmar's demise. Her scriptorial co-workers included her nephew Wezelin (a canon in Cologne) and abbot Ludwig of St Eucharius, who also sent a group of his monks to Rupertsberg.¹⁷ After copying of the *Liber divinorum operum* was complete c.1175, the manuscript, Ghent University Library MS 241, was taken to St Eucharius for editing. This final stage of preparation of Ghent 241, which Hildegard appears to have undertaken reluctantly, is described in a letter from her to Ludwig c.1174:

And because through the Supreme Judge my helper [i.e. Volmar] is removed, I therefore commit our composition [i.e. the *Liber divinorum operum*] only to you, humbly begging that you may watch over it cautiously, and amending it you may exercise foresight carefully—so that your name may be written down in the book of life.¹⁸

It may be assumed that the *Capitula* (Table of Contents) to the *Liber divinorum operum* in Ghent 241 was prepared at St Eucharius: the *Capitula* was compiled after completion of copying at Rupertsberg, it is written on separate fascicles to the Rupertsberg text, and the *Capitula* hand does not appear elsewhere in the text.¹⁹ Nonetheless, the *Capitula* hand is also found in numerous manuscripts prepared at Rupertsberg during the 1170s. These include two copies

¹⁴ Becker, 'Die Hirsauische Erneuerung' 203–4.

¹⁵ Hildegardis Bingensis, *Epistolarium*, ed. Louise van Acker, *Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis* 91–91A (Turnhout: Brepols, 1978) 466–68.

¹⁶ '...cognoscas quia in litteris tuis, scilicet in libro *Scivias*, delectati sumus sicut in omnibus divitiis,' Hildegardis, *Epistola CCXX*, *Epistolarium* 480. My translation.

¹⁷ Dronke & Derolez, intro., Hildegardis, *Liber divinorum operum* xcii.

¹⁸ 'Et quia per summum iudicem adiutor meus ablatu est ideo scripturam nostram tibi modo committo suppliciter rogando quod eam caute servas ac diligenter corrigendo prospicias ut etiam nomen tuum in libro uite scribatur.' Hildegardis, *Epistole CCXVII*, *Epistolarium* 477. My translation.

¹⁹ Dronke & Derolez, intro., Hildegardis, *Liber divinorum operum* lxxxiii—xcv.

of the *Scivias* and three copies of the *Liber vitae meritorum*, one of which is preserved in Dendermonde 9.²⁰ Significantly, the text, rubrication and neumes in the Dendermonde 9 copy of Hildegard's song cycle all appear in this same hand.²¹ The hand responsible for the Riesenkodez copy of Hildegard's song cycle is also found in contemporary sources, including the St Eucharius copy of the *Liber vitae meritorum* (Trier Hs. 68). It may be assumed from this that members of the St Eucharius community were responsible for preparation of the two extant copies of Hildegard's song cycle. When considering the possible transmission of *Sicut malum* from Rupertsberg to St Eucharius, we can therefore conclude that close ties existed between Hildegard and members of the St Eucharius community, and that members of this same community had assisted Hildegard in the redaction of her writings and songs, both at Rupertsberg and in Trier.

According to the dedication, the first 76 folios in Trier 107 were redacted during Eberhard's abbotship and completed by 1126.²² The dedication also cites two scribes, the above-mentioned cantor Remigius and a co-scribe named Heinrich. The first 76 folios preserve two works: the *Liber prognosticos future seculi* (fols 1^v-62^r) by Julian of Toledo (c. 642-690) and the *Regulae Morales* (fols 62^v-76^v) by Basil the Great (330-79).²³ Julian's text preserves a 'collection of sayings' on aspects of the afterlife ('Death, Judgement, Hell, Heaven') by Doctors of the Church,²⁴ while Basil's text comprises eighty-eight Scriptural 'sayings' taken from 1553 verses of the New Testament.²⁵ Both works might even be thought of as anthologies of authoritative sayings, and paired together they suggest that this manuscript functioned as a reference book used to advise readers on select theological issues.²⁶

It is in this environment that we find the Hildegard codicil, itself concerned with the theme of virginity. The *Scivias* extract opens with Song of Songs 2:3 followed by her commentary, which begins with a description of the speaker from verse 3, the *fidelis anima* [the faithful soul] who desires union with the *dilectus* [beloved], Christ—the 'husband of souls.'

²⁰ The other two copies of the *Liber vitae meritorum* are found in Berlin, Preußische Staatsbibliothek Cod. Theol. fol. 727 and Trier Hs. 68 (refer fn.1 above). The two copies of the *Scivias* are included in Rome, Bibliotheca Apostolica Vaticana MS Pal. lat. 311 and the Riesenkodez. Dronke & Derolez, intro., *Hildegardis, Liber divinorum operum* lxxxviii.

²¹ This contradicts Peter van Poucke's claim that the text and neumes are in different hands. Van Poucke bases the assumption of two scribes on a comparison of f- and c-clefs with the letters 'f' and 'c' in the text. The early folios of music include a slanted c-clef and an unadorned f-clef, which contrast to the vertical 'c's and decorated caps on the letter 'f' in the text. Further into the manuscript, however, the vertical c-clefs are indistinguishable from the text 'c's, and occasional plain text 'f's are indistinguishable from the f-clefs. The text and neumes use the same ink, while further comparison between the text hand and the hand used for neumes, ficta, differentiae text, text corrections (which were probably inserted at the same time as the neumes), and text dividers strongly suggests that a single scribe was responsible for the text and music in Dendermonde 9. It is also clear from the proportion of the letters and the use of ligatures that the rubrication in this copy of Hildegard's song cycle is in this same hand. See Hildegard of Bingen, *Symphonia Harmoniae Caelestium Revelationum: Dendermonde St-Pieters & Paulusabdij MS. Cod. 9*, intro. Peter van Poucke (Peer: Alamire, 1991) 11; Jeffreys, 'Melodia et rhetorica' 7-9.

²² 'Anno dominice incarnationis MCXXVI scriptus est hic liber sub Eberhardo abbate, Remigio cantore a heinrico scriptore. Quos simul in celo. dominus confederet agno. Cuius maiestas nunc et per secula regnat.' Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek Hs. 107 fol. 1^r.

²³ J. Marx, *Veröffentlichungen der Gesellschaft für Trierische Geschichte und Denkmalpflege 4: Handschriftenverzeichnis der Seminar-Bibliothek zu Trier*. Trierisches Archiv 8: Trier: Lintzschens Buchhandlung, 1912) 82-83; Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 115.

²⁴ J. N. Hillgarth, 'St Julian of Toledo in the Middle Ages,' *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 21 (1958) 15. This work survives in over 150 manuscripts.

²⁵ Paul J. Fedwick, 'Basil the Great,' *Dictionary of the Middle Ages*, ed. Joseph Strayer, vol.2 (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1983) 120.

²⁶ Hillgarth, 'St Julian' 16.

'As the apple tree among the trees of the woods, so is my beloved among the <sons>. I sat down under the shadow of him whom I desired; and his fruit was sweet to my palate' [Song of Songs 2:3]. Which is to say: The Son of the Virgin is the sweet Lover in chaste affection; and the faithful soul grasps Him to crown her integrity with His sweet embrace, renouncing an earthly husband. She unites herself to Christ, loves Him with binding certainty and regards Him in the mirror of faith. He is the most beautiful fruit of the fruitful tree...²⁷

The commentary goes on to explain how Christ 'gave salvation to the world through His Incarnation' and so 'bears the fruit of the sweetness of life.' It is also stated that the *fidelis anima* is to the *dilectus* as a wife is 'to a husband whom she married willingly and joyfully;' thus the *fidelis anima* is united to the *dilectus*, 'flowering perpetually with Him in the joy of the regal marriage.'²⁸

Hildegard's Marian text *Ave Maria* expounds a theme glimpsed at in the commentary: the role of the Blessed Virgin in salvation. Here the Virgin Mary is praised as the *auctrix vite* [author of life] who 'rebuilt salvation,' an act which redeemed humanity from its inherited state of sin:

Hail Mary, O author of life, rebuilding salvation, you who confounded death and crushed the serpent toward whom Eve stretched forth, her neck outstretched with the swelling of pride. You trampled on him when you bore the Son of God from heaven: Whom the Spirit of God breathed forth.²⁹

This text is followed on folio 77^v by the setting of *Sicut malum* which, if taken as a single narrative as it is set, can be read as a series of statements that describe a coming together of the speaker, Hildegard's *fidelis anima*, and the *dilectus*, who by verse 6 are physically entwined:

As the apple tree among the trees of the woods, so is my beloved among the sons.
I sat down under his shadow, whom I desired: and his fruit was sweet to my
palate.
He brought me into the cellar of wine, he set in order charity in me.
Stay me up with flowers, compass me about with apples: because I languish with
love.
His left hand is under my head, and his right hand shall embrace me.³⁰

As the *Scivias* was composed between 1141 and 1151, it may be assumed that in 1126 three-quarters of fol. 76^v and fol. 77^r, which complete a binio (fols 74^v–77^v), were blank. This assumption is confirmed by the two hands found on fols 76^v–77^v (Table 1), which are not used

²⁷ Columba Hart & Jane Bishop, trans., Hildegard of Bingen, *Scivias* (New York & Mahwah: Paulist Press, 1990) 439–40. Note that Hart and Bishop translate 'filios' as 'children,' rather than 'sons.' 'Sicut malum inter ligna silvarum sic dilectus meus inter filios sub umbra illius quem desiderabam sedi et fructus eius dulci gutturi meo hoc tale est filius virginis dulcissimus amator caste dilectionis quem apprehendit fidelis anima desiderans dulcissima eius amplexione integritatem suam coronare relicto carnali viro et se copulans christo eumque certissimo foedere amans et in speculo fidei aspiciens est pulcherrimus fructus fructiferae arboris.' Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek Hs. 107, fol. 76^v. See also Hildegardis, *Scivias* III, 8:16, ed. Adelgundis Führkötter & Angela Carlevaris, *Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis* 43–43A (Turnhout: Brepols, 1978) 501.

²⁸ Hildegard, *Scivias*, 440–41.

²⁹ Newman, trans., *Symphonia*. 'Ave Maria o auctrix vite reedificando salutem que mortem conturbasti et serpentem contrivisti ad quem se eva erexit erecta cervice cum sufflatu superbie hunc conculcasti dum de celo filium dei genusisti quem inspiravit spiritus dei.' Trier 107 fol. 77^r.

³⁰ *Bible*, 1749–52 English trans. of Latin Vulgate (1899; Rockford, Illinois: Tan Books & Publishers, 1971).

in any other part of Trier 107.³¹ The *Sicut malum* hand is contemporaneous with this second layer of copying, and comparison of the clef, text and corrections hand as well as the ink suggests that the text and neumes on folio 77^v are in the same hand.

Table 1: Hands in Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek Hs. 107 fols 76^v–77^v

Folio	Text	Hand
76 ^v	<i>Scivias</i> III; 8:16 'Sicut malum inter ligna. . . aliis quidene viriditatem nec fructum'	I
77 ^r	<i>Scivias</i> III; 8:16 cont. 'a se ipsis habentibus. . . cum illo florens in gaudio'	II
77 ^r	'Ave Maria O autrix vite. . . spiritus dei'.	I
77 ^v	<i>Sicut malum</i>	I

The notation on fol. 77^v resembles other notational systems in use along the Rhine during the twelfth century.³² There are five four-lined staves, and clefs are indicated for tertial lines, a practice duplicated in other mid- to late twelfth-century German sources.³³ In particular, the notation is similar to that used (by members of the St Eucharius community) at Rupertsberg during the 1170s, as documented in the Riesenkodez and Dendermonde 9, although the *Sicut malum* hand differs from the hands in these two sources. Nonetheless, each sign in Trier 107 has a counterpart in the two cyclic sources of Hildegard's music. Significantly, Trier 107 includes two signs for each of the *podatus* and *scandicus*: a square *podatus* is found on the initial syllable of 'Sicut,' but a hook-shaped *podatus* is used thereafter; similarly, a *scandicus* comprising a *praepunctum-virga* is used over 'inter' in verse 3, but a slightly different sign is used for the *scandicus* over '[intro]du[xit]' (see Example 1).³⁴ The single use of one sign prior to consistent use of another suggests that *Sicut malum* was copied from an exemplar, with the scribe adopting a preferred sign after initial use of a sign found in the version from which he copied.

As the first sign in each case corresponds with signs used at Rupertsberg during the 1170s, it is possible that an exemplar was obtained from there. Further to this, the hands and inks on fols 76^v–77^v of Trier 107 suggest that the *Scivias* commentary, the Marian text and *Sicut malum* were copied during the one sitting. Although the hands in Trier 107 differ from the hands of St Eucharius scribes who were active at Rupertsberg during the 1170s, the notation still refers to signs that they used. It is therefore possible that *Sicut malum* was copied after c.1179 (the *terminus ad quem* for the Riesenkodez).³⁵ As a copy of the *Scivias* was made at St Eucharius in 1210, there are conditions for transmission of the Hildegard codicil from Rupertsberg to St Eucharius after c.1179.

Turning now to the setting itself (Example 1), those aspects of Hildegard's music which bear out her musical style are taken here as 'pitch behaviour,' to borrow Peter Lefferts' term,³⁶

³¹ Becker notes that the dedication is also in a different hand to folios 1^v–76^v (perhaps the hand of Abbot Eberhard?) Becker, *Das Erzbistum* 115.

³² See for example, Köln, Historisches Archiv, Einzelblatt D182.

³³ See for example Graz, Universitätsbibliothek 807, redacted at Klosterneuburg (Austria) in c.1150. See *Le Manuscrit 897, Universitätsbibliothek Graz XII^e siècle: Graduel de Klosterneuburg*. PM 19 (Berne: Herbert Lang, 1964).

³⁴ A reproduction of this folio is included in Jeffreys, *Sicut malum* 26.

³⁵ It should also be noted that, contrary to the traditional view that Hildegard's music was first notated during the 1150s, there is evidence that Hildegard's music was first notated during 1170s. See Jeffreys, 'Melodia et Rhetorica' 56–59.

³⁶ Peter Lefferts, 'Signature-Systems & Tonal Types in the Fourteenth-Century French Chanson,' *Plain-song & Medieval Music* 4 (1995) 117.

Example 1: *Sicut malum*, Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek, Hs. 107, fol. 77^v

Sicut malum inter lig-
na stil-
va-
rum
sic di-
lec-
tus me-
us in-
ter fi-
li-
os
sub um-
bra li-
li-
us quem de-
si-
de-
ra-
bam se-
di
et fruc-
tus ei-
us dul-
ci gut-
tu-
ri me-
o
in-
tro-
du-
xit me rex in
cel-
lam vi-
na-
ri-
am
or-
di-
na-
vit in
me ca-
ri-
ta-
tem
ful-
ci-
te me flo-
ri-
bus sti-
pa-
te me ma-
lis
qui-
a a-
mo-
re lan-
gue-
le-
va ei-
us sub ce-
pi-
te me-
o et dex-
te-
ra li-
li-
us
am-
ple-
xa-
bi-
tur me.

and melodic process. These can be taken as a basis for establishing stylistic congruence between *Sicut malum* and her devotional songs. With respect to pitch behaviour, the basis for comparison is a series of assumptions derived using Hendrik van der Werf's method of describing the components of melody in terms of pitch position and pitch repetition relative to other pitches.³⁷ With respect to melodic process, Marianne Richert Pfau has already traced repetitions of melodic contours, or pitches which outline melodic phrases, within the context of modal categorisation throughout the Hildegard repertory.³⁸ The repetition of melodic contours between Hildegard's songs can also be linked to textual phrasing. I have demonstrated elsewhere that songs with similar grammatical arrangements exhibit similar melodic processes, a phenomenon which transcends both liturgical function and *maneria* (modal groups).³⁹ Thus Hildegard's settings can be taken as a set of discrete responses to text, with similar text structures producing similar melodic settings. The present discussion of Hildegard's melodic process is therefore based on similarities between text as well as melody.

Using the first of Van der Werf's criteria, repetition, the pitch most often initiating and ending musical phrases in Hildegard's songs is the final. The final is often complemented by repetition of the 5th above the final, and by ascents to the 4th above the 5th. As both notes are consonant with the final, this suggests a basic hierarchy of stacked 5ths and 4ths. This can be seen in Hildegard's Kyrie (see Example 2), where each phrase is punctuated by the final.⁴⁰ The note *c* is repeated mid-phrase and there is an ascent to *f* in all four phrases. The pitch hierarchy in this song is therefore F-c-f, or final-5th-4th. Similar hierarchies of alternate 5ths and 4ths are traceable in all of Hildegard's songs irrespective of liturgical function or *maneria*, while the upper and lower ranges of songs appear to be limited only by specifications of the medieval gamut. It should also be noted that, while this same hierarchy of 4ths and 5ths may be identified in all songs, it can be associated with pitches other than the final.⁴¹ The first assumption about pitch behaviour in Hildegard's songs is, therefore, that one can trace a vertical hierarchy of alternating 4ths and 5ths relative to an interpreted melodic centre.

A controlling feature of Hildegard's pitch behaviour is the alignment of syntactical and musical phrases. This can be seen in Hildegard's antiphon to God the Father, *O eterne deus* (see Example 3), where each grammatically separable phrase ends on either the final (E), the 5th above the final or on the 8ve above the final. Most phrases begin on one of these notes also, but two phrases near the opening of this antiphon are initiated by D, a 2nd below the final. Thus phrases can begin on a variety of pitches, but there is consistency between—or repetition of—pitches which appear at the end of successive phrases and/or clauses. The second assumption about melodic behaviour in Hildegard's songs is, therefore, that melodic contours, or pitches which form part of a hierarchy of alternate 5ths and 4ths above the final, consistently coincide with the ends of textual phrases and clauses.

³⁷ Hendrik van der Werf, *The Emergence of Gregorian Chant: A Comparative Study* (Rochester NY: Van der Werf, 1983) 43–46.

³⁸ Marianne Richert Pfau, 'Hildegard of Bingen's *Symphonia Armonie Celestium Revelationum: An Analysis of Musical Process, Modality and Text-Music Relations*,' Diss. State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1990, 140–212.

³⁹ See Jeffreys, 'Melodia et rhetorica' 157–241.

⁴⁰ Pitch names are given according to the Guidonian system with middle *c* as 'C'. The gamut is as follows: G A B C D E F G a b c d e f g a' b' c' d'.

⁴¹ Some songs, such as *O viriditas digit dei* and *O mirum admirandum*, incorporate the final as a secondary melodic centre. The former includes an E-b-e hierarchy and an A-E-a hierarchy may be identified in the latter, but the finals are b and E respectively. In other songs, such as *O gloriosissimi*, the final is excluded as a melodic centre for sections of the song; in this case, the hierarchy A-D-a-d dominates in a song that begins and ends on E. For other examples, see Jeffreys, 'Melodia et rhetorica' 64–68.

Example 2: Hildegard of Bingen, *Kyrie*, Wiesbaden, Hessische Landesbibliothek, Hs.2, fol. 472^v

Ky-ri-e ley-son.

Chris-te ley-son.

Ky-ri-e ley-son.

Ky-ri-e ley-son.

Example 3: Hildegard of Bingen, *O eterne deus*, Dendermonde, St Peter's & Paul's Abbey, Codex 9, fol. 153^r

O eterne deus nunc tibi placeat

ut in amore illo ardeas ut membra illa simas

que fecisti in eodem amore

cum filium tuumque nostrum in prima hora ante omnem creaturam

et inspira-ces-nostre hanc que super nos cadit

et abstrahere eam a nobis propter filium tuum

et perduc nos in leticulas

In *Sicut malum* (Example 1), a hierarchy of alternating 4ths and 5ths can be traced in relation to the final, D. With the text divided according to phrases and clauses, each phrase of melody ends either on the final or on the note a, with one of three notes—A, a and d—repeated mid phrase. This suggests the hierarchy (A)-D-a-d, or (4th)-final-5th-4th. Although the range of this setting extends down to G, A delimits the lower register in all but three phrases. In these three, G follows A before the melody ascends to D. This also happens in the final phrase of Hildegard's Ursuline antiphon *De patria etiam* (see Example 4). The dependant phrase 'sub umbra illius' ends on A while two phrases begin on this note. In terms of being able to trace a vertical hierarchy of alternating 4ths and 5ths, in this case (A)-D-a-d, and the location of melodic demarcators at the ends of phrases and clauses, there is nothing to distinguish pitch behaviour in *Sicut malum* from that in Hildegard's devotional song repertory.

Example 4: Hildegard of Bingen, *De patria etiam* (final phrase), Dendermonde, St Peter's & Paul's Abbey, Codex 9, fol.164^r



The next area of concern is the process of melody between these hierarchical demarcators. The notion that Hildegard's music was possibly improvised takes on considerable relevance here, as this suggests the process of melody will be informal, or marked by a lack of direct repetition between phrases. This is very much the case in Hildegard's devotional song repertory; as Ian Bent puts it, 'the melodic process has the freedom of oral composition.'⁴² This is also the case in *Sicut malum*, where no two phrases are the same. The examination of melodic processes calls for a closer examination of text distribution. For the sake of convenience, the antiphon *O successores*, which has a comparable text structure to *Sicut malum*— as well as similar range and the same final—is put forward for comparison. This is one of two songs by Hildegard devoted to Confessors:

O successores fortissimi leonis (subject)	O successors of the mightiest lion
inter templum et altare (prepositional phrase)	—between temple and altar
dominantes in ministracione eius (prepositional phrase)	ruling in His ministry,
sicut angeli sonant in laudibus (adverbial clause)	just as the angels resound in praises,
et sicut assunt populis in adiutorio (adverbial clause)	and just as they assist the peoples with aid;
vos estis inter illos (main clause)	you are among those
qui hec faciunt (relative clause)	who do these things
semper curam habentes in officio agni (adverbial phrase)	always taking care in the service of the lamb. ⁴³

⁴² Bent, 'Hildegard of Bingen' 554.

⁴³ Newman, trans., *Symphonia* 177.

This text can be described as a single sentence consisting of an independent clause (from 'vos estis') preceded by a series of prepositional phrases and adverbial clauses. With the setting divided according to the text (see Example 5), the pitch ending each phrase or clause is the final, D. Melodic phrases may be described as proceeding in one of two ways: phrases either ascend from or return to the D between the notes a and A; or they ascend from the final to the 5th above (a) and the 4th above that (d) before returning to the 5th above the final and eventually the final itself; this same movement also occurs in both Hildegard's Kyrie and her *O eterne deus*. The three phrases before the first adverbial clause (at 'sicut angeli sonant') repeat a similar process: each phrase ascends below or to the note a before returning to the final. At 'sicut angeli,' the melody ascends to the notes a and d before returning to the pitch regions outlined in the opening phrases. Repetition of this second process, albeit embellished, can be identified at 'et sicut.' The setting of the main clause beginning 'vos estis' and the relative clause 'qui hec faciunt' is initiated by a leap from D to a, as occurs at 'et sicut', but the melody descends to D and repeats the process outlined in the opening phrases of the song. In the final phrase, a similar process to that at 'et sicut assunt populis' can be identified, but with the note d repeated between 'semper curam habentes,' 'in officio' and the melisma on 'agni.'

If *Sicut malum* is likewise divided according to phrases and clauses, main clauses also appear after a series of adverbial/prepositional phrases or clauses:

Sicut malum inter ligna silvarum (adverbial phrase)	As the apple tree among the trees of the woods
sic dilectus meus inter filios (adverbial phrase)	so is my beloved among the sons.
sub umbra illius quem desiderabam sedi (prepositional clause + relative clause)	I sat down under his shadow whom I desired:
et fructus eius dulci gutturi meo (subject + adjectival phrase)	and his fruit was sweet to my palate.
introduxit me rex in cellarum vinariam (main clause)	He brought me into the cellar of wine;
ordinavit in me caritatem (main clause)	he set in order charity in me.
fulcite me floribus stipate me malis (main clause)	Stay me up with flowers compass me about with apples:
quia amore languero (causal clause)	because I languish with his love.
leva eius sub capite meo et dextera illius amplexabit me. ⁴⁴ (main clause)	His left hand is under my head and his right hand shall embrace me. ⁴⁵

With the setting phrased accordingly (refer to Example 1), two types of melodic motion can be identified: melodic phrases either surround D between notes neighbouring A (i.e. G) and a (b/c); or phrases proceed in a comparable way to that over 'et sicut assunt populis' (D-a-d-a-D) in *O successores*. The opening intonation on 'Sicut malum' is similar to that which initiates Hildegard's responsory *O vos felices radices* (see Example 6), which is sounded on E. After this intonation, the setting of each opening dependent phrase ascends to the note a

⁴⁴ Trier, Priesterseminar Bibliothek Hs. 107 fol.77'.

⁴⁵ Bible, Latin Vulgate.

Example 5: Hildegard of Bingen, *O successores*, Dendermonde, St Peter's & Paul's Abbey, Codex 9, fol. 164^r

The musical score consists of eight staves of music in a single system. Each staff begins with a 'D' time signature. The lyrics are written below the notes. The text is: O suc- ces- so- res for- tis- si- mi le- o- nis in- ter tem- plum et al- ta- re do- mi- nan- tes in mi- ni- stra- ti- o- ne ei- us si- cut an- ge- li so- nant in lau- di- bus et si- cut as- sunt po- pu- lis in a- diu- to- ri- o vos e- stis in- ter il- los qui hec fa- ci- unt sem- per cu- ram ha- ben- tes in of- fi- ci- e ag- ni.

Example 6: Hildegard of Bingen, *O vos felices radices* (opening), Dendermonde, St Peter's & Paul's Abbey, Codex 9, fol. 160^r

The musical score shows the opening of the piece on a single staff. The lyrics are: O vos fe- li- ces

before returning to the final. The third phrase, set to an independent clause, moves between A and D before also returning to the final. The final phrase before the separable clause beginning 'introduxit me rex' coincides with the second process, D-a-d-a-(D); the position of this phrase before a separable clause and its initiation by the conjunction 'et' resonates the setting of the phrase 'et sicut assunt populis' in *O successores*.

The setting of verse 4 suggests a similar process to that in the opening phrases, but phrases begin on the note a (and one phrase begins on C) rather than D. This perhaps invites comparison with the leaps at 'vos' and 'qui' in *O successores*, as later phrases in both songs exhibit processes similar to their respective openings, but the beginnings of these later phrases vary. The setting of verse 5 also resonates the setting of 'semper curam habentes in officio agni' in *O successores*—in terms of both process and position after an independent clause. The final phrase of *Sicut malum*, verse 6, suggests a progression similar to that employed in opening phrases, and again there is a melisma on the final word. These consistencies between *Sicut malum* and *O successores* suggest that the same composer was responsible for both songs.

In this paper appropriate conditions have been shown to exist for the transmission of the setting of Song of Songs 2:3–6 from Rupertsberg to St Eucharius. Close ties between Rupertsberg and St Eucharius were established during Hildegard's life time, and members of the St Eucharius community assisted her with the redaction of her writings and music during the 1170s. Details gauged from the notation on folio 77^v of Trier 107 suggests that a copy of *Sicut malum* could have been obtained from Rupertsberg after c.1179, while this time frame coincides with preparation of a copy of the *Scivias* at St Eucharius in 1210. Finally, comparison of melodic style between songs from Hildegard's devotional song repertory and *Sicut malum* indicates that she could have composed the setting of the latter. These are grounds on which to include *Sicut malum* among the Hildegard repertory, thus bringing the number of her surviving devotional song settings to seventy-eight.